

TRUSTEES OF THE CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY

**California State University
Office of the Chancellor
Glenn S. Dumke Auditorium*
401 Golden Shore
Long Beach, CA 90802**

September 23, 2020

Presiding: Lillian Kimbell, Chair

9:45 a.m. Board of Trustees Virtually via Teleconference

Call to Order

Roll Call

Chair's Report

Chancellor's Report

Academic Senate CSU Report: *Chair—Robert Keith Collins*

California State Student Association Report: *President—Zahraa Khuraibet*

California State University Alumni Council Report: *President—Michelle Power*

Consent

- Action** 1. Approval of Minutes of the Meeting of July 22, 2020
Action 2. Approval of Committee Resolutions as follows:

Committee on Committees

2. Amendments to Board of Trustees' Standing Committee Assignments for 2020-2021

Committee on Educational Policy

3. California State University Board of Trustees Policy for Awarding Honorary Degrees
4. Academic Master Plan Update for a Fast-Track Program at San José State University

Joint Committee on Governmental Relations and Educational Policy

1. Proposition 16: Allows Diversity as a Factor in Public Employment, Education, and Contracting Decisions. Legislative Constitutional Amendment.

***PLEASE NOTE: Due to the Governor's proclamation of a State of Emergency resulting from the threat of COVID-19, and pursuant to the Governor's Executive Order N-25-20 issued on March 12, 2020, some or all of the members of the Board of Trustees may participate in this meeting remotely, either by telephonic or video conference means. The Dumke Auditorium shall nonetheless be open and available for members of the public to attend, observe the proceedings of the meeting (including the audio/video transmissions of trustees participating from remote locations), and offer public comment pursuant to the published protocol for "Addressing the Board of Trustees."**

**The Board of Trustees is a public body, and members of the public have a right to attend and participate in its meetings. This schedule of meetings is established as a best approximation of how long each scheduled meeting will take to complete its business. Each meeting will be taken in sequence, except in unusual circumstances. Depending on the length of the discussions, which are not possible to predict with precision in advance, the scheduled meeting times indicated may vary widely. For two-day meetings, items scheduled for one day may be heard either the day before or the day after depending upon the time spent on each matter. The public is advised to take this uncertainty into account in planning to attend any meeting listed on this schedule.

Committee on Campus Planning, Buildings and Grounds

2. California State University, San Bernardino, College of Arts and Letters/Theater Building Renovation and Addition

Committee of the Whole

2. Conferral of Title of Trustee Emerita—Rebecca D. Eisen
3. Conferral of Title of Trustee Emeritus—Hugo N. Morales

Committee on University and Faculty Personnel

2. Executive Compensation: Chancellor-select, California State University

***PLEASE NOTE: Due to the Governor’s proclamation of a State of Emergency resulting from the threat of COVID-19, and pursuant to the Governor’s Executive Order N-25-20 issued on March 12, 2020, some or all of the members of the Board of Trustees may participate in this meeting remotely, either by telephonic or video conference means. The Dumke Auditorium shall nonetheless be open and available for members of the public to attend, observe the proceedings of the meeting (including the audio/video transmissions of trustees participating from remote locations), and offer public comment pursuant to the published protocol for “Addressing the Board of Trustees.”**

**The Board of Trustees is a public body, and members of the public have a right to attend and participate in its meetings. This schedule of meetings is established as a best approximation of how long each scheduled meeting will take to complete its business. Each meeting will be taken in sequence, except in unusual circumstances. Depending on the length of the discussions, which are not possible to predict with precision in advance, the scheduled meeting times indicated may vary widely. For two-day meetings, items scheduled for one day may be heard either the day before or the day after depending upon the time spent on each matter. The public is advised to take this uncertainty into account in planning to attend any meeting listed on this schedule.

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF BOARD OF TRUSTEES

**Trustees of the California State University
Office of the Chancellor
Glenn S. Dumke Auditorium*
401 Golden Shore
Long Beach, California**

July 22, 2020

Trustees Present

Lillian Kimbell, Chair
Wenda Fong, Vice Chair
Silas H. Abrego
Larry L. Adamson
Jane W. Carney
Adam Day
Rebecca D. Eisen
Douglas Faigin
Debra S. Farar
Jean Picker Firstenberg
Maryana Khames
Jack McGrory
Hugo Morales
Romey Sabalius
Lateefah Simon
Christopher Steinhauser
Peter J. Taylor
Timothy P. White, Chancellor
Superintendent Tony K. Thurmond

Chair Lillian Kimbell called the meeting of the Board of Trustees to order.

Public Comment

Due to the virtual format of the July 21-22, 2020 meeting, all public comment took place at the beginning of the meeting's open session prior to all committees. For the purposes of public record, the board heard from the following individuals during the revised public comment period:

***PLEASE NOTE: Due to the Governor's proclamation of a State of Emergency resulting from the threat of COVID-19, and pursuant to the Governor's Executive Orders N-25-20 and N-29-20 issued on March 12, 2020 and March 17, 2020, respectively, all members of the Board of Trustees may participate in meetings remotely, either by telephonic or video conference means. Out of consideration for the health, safety and well-being of the members of the public and the Chancellor's Office staff, the July 21-22, 2020 meeting of the CSU Board of Trustees was conducted entirely virtually via Zoom teleconference.**

BoT

Agenda Item 1

September 20-23, 2020

Matt Foulkes, Fullerton Community Dev Director; Marcus Reveles, ASI President, CSU Fullerton; Theresa Harvey, President/CEO North Orange County Chamber; Francis Colwell, President, Friends of the Fullerton Arboretum; Greg Schulz, President, Fullerton College; Linda Vasquez, Sr. Public Affairs Director, College Campaign; Gregory Thomas; Staff Physician, Cal PolySLO; Ejmin Hakobian, CSULA Alum; Yahaira Victorino, Student, Sacramento State; Alejandro Bupara, Student, Cal Poly SLO; Melissa Jerez, Student, Chico State; Kaila Moore-Jones, Student, CSU Northridge; Kay Gamo, Physician, San Francisco State; Antonio Canzona, CSULA Alum; Evelyn Jimenez, Student (CSUN); Shirley Weber, Assemblymember, 79th District; Jerald Bolden, Sac State Alum; Monique Crawford, Sac State Alum; Erynn Turner, Sac State Alum; Miles Meckling, Sac State Student; William Schmidt, Sac State Alum; Marie Williams, Sac State Student; Brennan Pearson, Founder/CEO, Verus Advising; Mario (Teresa) Guerrero, Faculty (Cal Poly Pomona); Max Johnson, Student (SDSU); Charles Toombs, President, CFA (SDSU); Kim Geron, CFA Chapter PA/Leg Chair (East Bay); Theresa Montañó, CFA Teacher Ed Caucus Chair (CSUN); Sharon Elise, CFA AVP, Racial & Social Justice (CSUSM); Steven Filling, CFA Political Action Legislative Committee Chair (Stanislaus); Craig Stone, Faculty (CSULB); Leece Oliver, Faculty (Fresno); Meghan O' Donnell, CFA AVP, Council of Lecturers (CSUMB); Siana Fields, Student (SQE); Jeff Blutinger, Faculty (CSULB); Teresa Wright, Faculty (CSULB); David Shafer, Faculty (CSULB); Vanessa Chicaiza, CSU Student (Bakersfield); Frankie de la Pena, CSU Student (Bakersfield); Sneha Guduru, CSU Student (Bakersfield); Divyang Motavar, CSU Student (Bakersfield); Maria Espinoza, CSU Student (Bakersfield); Nadia Mendoza-Mendez, CSU Student (Bakersfield); Anastasia Nesbitt, Alum (CSULB); Stephen Sobonya, CSU Student (Sacramento); Cecilia Arzaga, Member of the Public; Rocky Sanchez, VP for Representation, CSUEU; Tessa Reese, Chair Bargaining Unit 2, CSUEU; Pam Robertson, Vice Chair Bargaining Unit 2, CSUEU; Don Moreno, Vice Chair Bargaining Unit 5, CSUEU; Tony Spraggins, Chair Bargaining Unit 7, CSUEU; Rich McGee, Chair Bargaining Unit 9, CSUEU; Martin Brenner, Vice Chair Bargaining Unit 9, CSUEU; Neil Jacklin, President, CSUEU; Drew Scott, Teamsters Local 2010; Cal Mason, Teamsters Local 2010

Chair's Report

Chair Kimbell's complete report is available online at the following link:

<https://www2.calstate.edu/csu-system/board-of-trustees/reports-of-the-chair/Pages/july-2020.aspx>

Chancellor's Report

Chancellor Timothy P. White's report is available online at the following link:

<https://www2.calstate.edu/csu-system/board-of-trustees/chancellor-reports/Pages/july-22-2020.aspx>

Report of the Academic Senate CSU

CSU Academic Senate Chair, Robert Keith Collin's complete report is available online at the following link:

<https://www2.calstate.edu/csu-system/faculty-staff/academic-senate/Pages/ASCSU-Chairs-Report.aspx>

Report from the California State Student Association

CSSA President Zahraa Khuraibet's complete report is available online at the following link:

<https://www.calstatestudents.org/public-documents/#president>

Report of the California State University Alumni Council

Alumni Council President Michelle Power's report is available online at the following link: <https://www2.calstate.edu/impact-of-the-csu/alumni/council/board-of-trustee-reports/Pages/default.aspx>

Board of Trustees

The minutes of the meeting of May 12, 2020 were unanimously approved by roll call vote as submitted.

Prior to the approval of the consent agenda, Trustee Abrego requested that item 3, Recommended Amendments to Title 5 Regarding Ethnic Studies and Social Justice - from the Committee on Educational Policy - be removed from the consent agenda for separate discussion and approval.

Chair Kimbell asked to move all the remaining consent agenda items for approval. There was a second. There was a roll call vote and the Board of Trustees unanimously approved the following resolutions:

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATIONAL POLICY

Recommended Amendment to Title 5 Regarding Residency Reclassification – Financial Independence (REP 07-20-04)

RESOLVED by the Board of Trustees of the California State University that Title 5, California Code of Regulations section 41905.5 be amended as follows:

Title 5. Education
Division 5. Board of Trustees of the California State Universities
Chapter 1. California State University
Subchapter 5. Administration
Article 4. Nonresident Tuition

§ 41905.5. Residence Reclassification - Financial Independence Requirement.

~~Any~~ A nonresident student requesting reclassification to resident for tuition purposes must demonstrate financial independence. A student shall be considered financially independent if ~~s/he~~ the student has not and will not be claimed as an exemption for state and federal tax purposes by ~~his/her~~ a parent or legal guardian in the calendar year the reclassification application is made and in any of the three calendar years prior to the reclassification application; has not and will not receive more than seven hundred fifty dollars (\$750) per year in financial assistance from ~~his/her~~ a parent or legal guardian in the calendar year the reclassification application is made and in any of the three calendar years prior to the reclassification application, and; has not lived and will not live for more than six weeks in the home of ~~his/her~~ a parent or legal guardian during the calendar year the reclassification application is made and in any of the three calendar years prior to the reclassification application. ~~A nonresident student who has been appointed to serve as a graduate student teaching assistant, graduate student research assistant, or graduate student teaching associate on any California State University campus and employed on a 0.49 or more time basis is exempt from this requirement.~~

Financial independence shall not be considered in a reclassification analysis if the student meets at least one of the following criteria:

- A. Dependent on a parent who has California residence (pursuant to Cal.Educ. §68060 through §68062) for more than one year immediately preceding the residence determination date for the academic term for which reclassification is requested
- B. Enrolled in a graduate or post-baccalaureate program, regardless of age
- C. At least 24 years of age by the residence determination date for the academic term for which reclassification is requested
- D. Married or in registered domestic partnership as of the residence determination date, regardless of age
- E. All active duty (including National Guard members and reservists) members serving in the U.S. Armed Forces
- F. Veteran of the U.S. Armed Forces
- G. Has a legal dependent other than a spouse or registered domestic partner
- H. Status as a ward of the court or foster youth at any time since turning the age of 13, or both parents are deceased
- I. Declared by a court to be an emancipated minor
- J. Status as an unaccompanied youth who is homeless or at risk of becoming homeless pursuant to federal financial aid rules

Note: Authority cited: Sections 68044 and 89030, Education Code. Reference: Section 68044, Education Code.

COMMITTEE ON CAMPUS PLANNING, BUILDINGS AND GROUNDS

**California State University, Long Beach Housing Expansion Phase 1 – Housing Administration and Commons Building Project Supplemental Environmental Impact Report
(RCPBG 07-20-03)**

RESOLVED, by the Board of Trustees of the California State University, that:

1. The Board of Trustees finds that the Supplemental Environmental Impact Report (SEIR) to the 208 Campus Master Plan Update EIR has been prepared in accordance with the requirements of the California Environmental Quality Act.
2. The SEIR addresses the proposed project and all the discretionary actions related to the project as identified in the SEIR.
3. The Board of Trustees hereby certifies the SEIR for the California State University, Long Beach Housing Expansion Phase 1 – Housing Administration and Commons Building Project dated July 2020.
4. Prior to the certification of the SEIR, the Board of Trustees reviewed and considered the above SEIR and finds that it reflects the independent judgment of the Board of Trustees. The Board of Trustees hereby certifies the SEIR as complete and adequate and finds that it addresses all potentially significant environmental impacts of the project and fully complies with the requirements of CEQA. For purposes of CEQA, the administrative record includes the following:
 - a. The Final SEIR for the California State University, Long Beach Housing Expansion Phase 1 – Housing Administration and Commons Building Project;
 - b. The Final SEIR, including comments received on the Draft SEIR, responses to comments, and revisions to the Draft SEIR in response to comments received;
 - c. The previously approved 2008 Master Plan Update EIR;
 - d. The proceedings before the Board of Trustees relating to the subject proposed project, including testimony and documentary evidence introduced at such proceedings; and
 - e. All attachments, documents incorporated, and references made in the documents as specified in items (a) through (d) above.
5. This resolution is adopted pursuant to the requirements of Section 21081 of Public Resources Code and Section 15091 of the State CEQA Guidelines which require that the Board of Trustees make findings prior to the approval of a project.

BoT

Agenda Item 1

September 20-23, 2020

6. The Board of Trustees hereby adopts the CEQA Findings of Fact and Mitigation and Monitoring Reporting Program, including all mitigation measures identified therein, for Agenda Item 2 of the July 21-22, 2020 meeting of the Committee on Campus Planning, Buildings and Grounds, which identifies the specific impacts of the proposed project and related mitigation measures, which are hereby incorporated by reference. The mitigation measures identified in the Mitigation and Monitoring Reporting Program shall be monitored and reported in accordance with the requirements of CEQA.
7. The Board of Trustees hereby adopts the Statement of Overriding Considerations stating that the project benefits to the California State University outweigh the remaining significant and unavoidable cultural (built historical) resource impacts from implementation of the Housing Expansion Phase 1 – Housing Administration and Commons Building Project as disclosed in the SEIR.
8. The Final SEIR has identified potentially significant impacts that may result from implementation of the proposed project. However, the Board of Trustees, by adopting the Findings of Fact, finds that the inclusion of certain mitigation measures as part of the project approval will reduce most, but not all, of those effects to less than significant levels. Those impacts which are not reduced to less than significant levels are identified as significant and unavoidable and are overridden due to specific project benefits to the CSU identified in the Findings of Fact and Statement of Overriding Considerations.
9. The project will benefit the California State University.
10. The chancellor or his designee is requested under Delegation of Authority granted by the Board of Trustees to file the Notice of Determination for the Final Supplemental Environmental Impact Report for the California State University, Long Beach Housing Expansion Phase 1 – Housing Administration and Commons Building Project.

California State University, Fullerton Master Plan Update and Enrollment Ceiling Increase (RCPBG 07-20-04)

RESOLVED, by the Board of Trustees of the California State University, that:

1. The Board of Trustees finds that the 2020 FEIR has been prepared in accordance with the requirements of the California Environmental Quality Act.
2. The FEIR addresses the proposed Master Plan Update and all discretionary actions related to the project as identified in the FEIR.
3. The Board of Trustees hereby certifies the FEIR for the California State University, Fullerton Master Plan Update dated July 2020.

4. Prior to the certification of the FEIR, the Board of Trustees reviewed and considered the above FEIR and found it to reflect the independent judgment of the Board of Trustees. The Board of Trustees hereby certifies the FEIR as complete and adequate and finds that it addresses all potentially significant environmental impacts of the project and fully complies with the requirements of CEQA. For purposes of CEQA and the State CEQA Guidelines, the administrative record includes the following:
 - a. The DEIR for the California State University, Fullerton Master Plan Update;
 - b. The FEIR, including comments received on the DEIR, responses to comments, and revisions to the DEIR in response to comments received;
 - c. The proceedings before the Board of Trustees relating to the proposed Master Plan Update, including testimony and documentary evidence introduced at such proceedings; and
 - d. All attachments, documents incorporated, and references made in the documents as specified in items (a) through (c) above.
5. This resolution is adopted pursuant to the requirements of Section 21081 of the Public Resources Code and Section 15091 of the State CEQA Guidelines which require the Board of Trustees to make findings prior to the approval of the project.
6. The Board of Trustees hereby adopts the CEQA Findings of Fact and Mitigation and Monitoring Program, including the mitigation measures identified therein for Agenda Item 3 of the July 21-22, 2020 meeting of the Committee on Campus Planning, Buildings and Grounds, which identifies the specific impacts of the proposed Master Plan Update and related mitigation measures, hereby incorporated by reference. The required mitigation measures shall be monitored and reported in accordance with the Mitigation and Monitoring Reporting Program, which meets the requirements of CEQA.
7. The Board of Trustees hereby adopts the Statement of Overriding Considerations stating that project benefits to The California State University outweigh the remaining significant and unavoidable air quality, greenhouse gas emissions, and cultural resources impacts.
8. The FEIR has identified potentially significant impacts that may result from implementation of the proposed Master Plan Update. However, the Board of Trustees, by adopting the Findings of Fact, finds that the inclusion of certain mitigation measures as a part of the project approval will reduce most, but not all, of these effects to less than significant levels. Those impacts which are not reduced to less than significant levels are identified as significant and unavoidable and are overridden due to specific project benefits to the CSU identified in the Findings of Fact and Statement of Overriding Considerations.

BoT
Agenda Item 1
September 20-23, 2020

9. The project will benefit The California State University.
10. The California State University, Fullerton 2039 Campus Master Plan revision dated July 2020 is approved.
11. The chancellor or his designee is requested under Delegation of Authority granted by the Board of Trustees to file the Notice of Determination for the FEIR for the California State University, Fullerton Master Plan Update.

**JOINT COMMITTEE ON FINANCE AND
CAMPUS PLANNING, BUILDINGS AND GROUNDS**

**California State University, Fullerton Student Housing Phase 4 - Approval to Amend the 2020-2021 Capital Outlay Program; Approval of Schematic Design; Approval to Issue Trustees of the California State University Systemwide Revenue Bonds and Related Debt Instruments
(RFIN/CPBG 07-20-03)**

RESOLVED, by the Board of Trustees of the California State University that:

1. The project before the Board of Trustees is consistent with the previously certified Master Plan Update Final EIR.
2. The 2020-2021 Capital Outlay Program is amended to include \$122,504,000 for preliminary plans, working drawings, construction, and equipment for the California State University, Fullerton Student Housing Phase 4 project.
3. The schematic plans for the California State University, Fullerton Student Housing Phase 4 project are approved at a project cost of \$122,504,000 at CCCI 6840.
4. Financing for the California State University, Fullerton Student Housing Phase 4 project as described in this Agenda Item 2 of the Joint Committees on Finance and Campus Planning, Buildings and Grounds at the July 21-22, 2020 meeting of the CSU Board of Trustees is approved. Orrick, Herrington & Sutcliffe LLP, as bond counsel, is preparing resolutions to be presented at this meeting that authorize interim and permanent financing for the Project described in this Agenda Item 2 and provide for the following:
 - a. Authorize the sale and issuance of the Trustees of the California State University Systemwide Revenue Bonds, and/or the sale and issuance of related debt instruments, including shorter term and variable rate debt, floating and fixed rate loans placed directly with banks, and bond anticipation notes (BANs) to support interim financing under the CSU commercial paper (CP) program, in an aggregate amount not-to-exceed \$113,230,000 and certain actions relating thereto.

- b. Provide a delegation to the chancellor; the executive vice chancellor and chief financial officer; the assistant vice chancellor, Financial Services; and the assistant vice chancellor, Financing, Treasury, and Risk Management; and their designees to take any and all necessary actions to execute documents for the sale and issuance of the revenue bonds or related debt instruments.
5. The chancellor or his designee is requested under the Delegation of Authority granted by the Board of Trustees to file the Notice of Exemption for the project.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

**California State University, Sacramento Conceptual Approval of Two Public Private Partnerships for the Development of Real Property
(RFIN 07-20-02)**

RESOLVED, by the Board of Trustees of the California State University, that the Trustees:

1. Approve the concept of two public-public partnerships for the Ramona property at California State University, Sacramento;
2. Authorize the chancellor and the campus to enter into negotiations for agreements as necessary to develop final plans for the public-public partnerships as explained in Agenda Item 2 of the July 21-22, 2020 meeting of the Committee on Finance;
3. Will consider the following additional action items relating to the final plan:
 - a) Certification of Final California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) documentation.
 - b) Approval of development and financial plans negotiated by the campus with the advice of the chancellor;
 - c) Approval of any amendments to the Non-State Capital Outlay Program;
 - d) Approval of the schematic designs.

**California State University Doctorate of Occupational Therapy Tuition
(RFIN 07-20-03)**

RESOLVED, By the Board of Trustees of the California State University, that the CSU Occupational Therapy Doctorate Tuition Fee is hereby established; and, be it further

BoT
Agenda Item 1
September 20-23, 2020

RESOLVED, That the tuition fee rate approved for the 2022-2023 academic year and Summer 2023 shall be \$8,598 per semester campus term. Students will be assessed the Occupational Therapy Doctorate Tuition Fee rate each term, irrespective of the number of units taken. Students enrolled in Occupational Therapy Doctorate degree programs also shall be subject to campus-based mandatory fees; and, be it further

RESOLVED, That recommended increases in the CSU Occupational Therapy Doctorate Tuition Fee will be based on increased costs of the programs, and be it further

RESOLVED, That the chancellor is delegated authority to further adopt, amend, or repeal the CSU Occupational Therapy Doctorate Tuition Fee rate if such action is required by the budget act, and that such changes made by the chancellor are communicated promptly to the trustees.

COMMITTEE ON INSTITUTIONAL ADVANCEMENT

**Naming of the Nicholas and Lee Begovich Center for Gravitational-Wave Physics and Astronomy – California State University, Fullerton
(RIA 07-20-07)**

RESOLVED, by the Board of Trustees of the California State University, that the Center for Gravitational-Wave Physics and Astronomy at California State University, Fullerton be named as the Nicholas and Lee Begovich Center for Gravitational-Wave Physics and Astronomy.

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE

**Conferral of the Title of Student Trustee Emeritus–Juan Fernando García
(RCOW 07-20-02)**

RESOLVED, by the Board of Trustees of the California State University, that this board confers the title of Student Trustee Emeritus on Juan Fernando García, with all the rights and privileges thereto.

**Conferral of Title of Vice Chancellor Emeritus–Larry Mandel
(RCOW 07-20-03)**

RESOLVED, by the Board of Trustees of the California State University, that this board confers the title of Vice Chancellor Emeritus on Larry Mandel, with all the rights and privileges thereto.

Prior to the approval of the consent agenda, Trustee Abrego requested that item 3, Recommended Amendments to Title 5 Regarding Ethnic Studies and Social Justice - from the Committee on Educational Policy - be removed from the consent agenda for separate discussion.

Trustee Abrego made a motion to suspend the action item regarding amendments to Title 5 regarding ethnic studies and social justice from the Committee on Educational Policy and postpone the board action to the next meeting in September. There was a second on the motion. Trustee Abrego expressed concerns regarding the proposal noting the importance for unity and shared governance with faculty, particularly faculty from the CSU Council on Ethnic Studies. Trustee Abrego stated that he felt there needed to be additional consultation with faculty and stakeholders on the proposed Title 5 amendments to ensure curriculum meets the proposed ethnic studies and social justice requirements.

Trustee Taylor directed the trustees to refer to the written agenda item listing the consultation and meetings that took place to inform the proposal that was before the board for action and encouraged a no vote to postpone the action. Trustee Simon echoed Trustee Abrego's concerns for broader consultation with not only CSU stakeholders but with national stakeholders in the ethnic studies communities. She further stated her concern for students to be able to forego an ethnic studies course and meet the requirement with a social justice course and instead viewed the proposal as a social justice requirement with ethnic studies course offerings. While recognizing the tremendous amount of work, study and collaboration that went in to preparing the proposal, without broad support from the ethnic studies community she stated that in its present form she could not support the proposal. Trustee Morales concurred with Trustee Simon's statement that the proposal was more reflective of a social justice requirement and that he applauds and supports a movement towards a social justice requirement, however noting that he also did not agree that the current proposal was an ethnic studies requirement. Trustee Khames agreed with Trustee Morales' and Trustee Simon's concerns that the proposal was more a social justice requirement with ethnic studies as a component but not an explicit requirement on its own. She further stated that she supports the motion to postpone the action in order to continue broad consultation with stakeholders to ensure the proposal reflects the current needs of CSU communities and the country at this time.

BoT

Agenda Item 1

September 20-23, 2020

Trustee Eisen echoed Trustee Taylor's comments that the time for the board to take action on the item was before them and they should not postpone the vote. She referenced language from proposed Assembly Bill 1460 (Weber) that the rationale for the legislation was to ensure students of the CSU "acquire the knowledge and skills that will help them comprehend the diversity and Social Justice history of the United States and of the society in which they live to enable them to contribute to that society as responsible and constructive citizens." She stated that the intent and rationale of the CSU's proposed Title 5 amendments also seeks to serve the CSU students from a broader lens with as many varied perspectives as possible. She further stated that it would be the CSU faculty who would be the ones to best determine and develop the curricula that has ethnic studies as an anchor to fulfill not only the requirement but also the intent of best serving students with a robust, quality education.

Chancellor White commented that CSU faculty would continue to define the work necessary to shape the general education requirement as the proposal, if approved, would be implemented over the many months ahead. He noted with regard to consultation, that each of the 23 campuses were invited to complete a survey and provide input and to specifically engage their ethnic studies faculty. He affirmed that the proposal champions the study for historical racial and ethnic groups and gives students a chance to connect with other marginalized groups as well as the tools and resources to put their knowledge into action, with ethnic studies as the anchor, and think deeply about students whose identities cover many different areas. Chancellor White reminded the board that the work to develop this proposal had been conducted over a six-year period and the full board should have the opportunity to vote at this time.

Superintendent Thurmond acknowledged the broader conversations taking place around the country regarding racial injustice and the need for healing as much as justice. He expressed his appreciation for the many students voicing their support for ethnic studies courses as a way to help foster that healing and continue these critical conversations. He encouraged the board to support Trustee Abrego's motion to adopt more time to engage in the discourse around ethnic studies, not just of the four main disciplines, but as a broader movement that has spanned decades. He stated he welcomed more consultation, conversation and collaboration with the ethnic studies communities and experts to best broaden and better understand the ethnic studies movement and urged trustees to support the motion.

Following the discussion, Chair Kimbell called for a roll call vote. Superintendent Thurmond called for a point of order prior to the roll call vote for clarification that supporting the motion would in effect kill the item as the Assembly would be voting on legislation within a few weeks on an ethnic studies requirement that would then go to the governor for signature. Chancellor White addressed the question by stating that AB 1460 (Weber) would be brought before the Assembly for a vote and if the board postponed their action to September the governor would be presented with this bill without having a CSU proposal before him as well. Chancellor White noted that our governor champions a California for all and that the proposal before the board is really a CSU for all; that it is grounded in ethnic studies but also broader and more inclusive. So

to the point of order, if the board was to not act and AB 1460 moved forward the motion to postpone the vote would essentially not allow trustees to vote on the proposal. He stressed the importance of giving the governor an opportunity to support all of our students and communities as does this board by having the opportunity to vote at this meeting. Trustee Abrego stated that the vote needed to be on the merits of the proposal and not on whether the governor would sign the bill. Superintendent Thurmond spoke in favor to Trustee Abrego's statement that the board should make this vote solely on the proposal as presented and not on being in support or opposed to the proposed legislation that the governor may or may not sign. He acknowledged Chancellor White's comments articulating the urgency for board action, though added that given the proposed legislation there may be further opportunities for continued discussion and collaboration on both proposals addressing such an important topic that all parties could benefit from. Trustee Sabalius concluded the discussion on the point of order that the action by the board at this meeting would not mark an end but a beginning for further discussion on the Title 5 amendment creating the framework to establish the new requirement. He strongly urged the Chancellor's Office to continue to engage in extensive and meaningful consultation with the faculty especially the Statewide Academic Senate as the elected represented body of the faculty as well as disciplinary experts. Chancellor White affirmed the commitment to do exactly what Trustee Sabalius requested.

Chair Kimbell again called for the roll call vote. There were five votes to support the motion (Trustees Abrego, Khames, Morales, Simon and Superintendent Thurmond), fourteen votes opposed (Trustees Adamson, Carney, Day, Eisen, Faigin, Farar, Firstenberg, Fong, Kimbell, McGrory, Sabalius, Steinhauer, Taylor and Chancellor White), and no abstentions. The motion to postpone the action item to the September meeting did not pass.

Trustee Morales made a motion to amend the proposed Title 5 language to remove ethnic studies and only include social justice for the requirement to instead read as "A minimum of 3 semester units or 4 quarter units at the lower-division in study designed to understand ~~ethnic studies and~~ social justice." There was a second. Trustee Morales stated that with this amendment it would allow him to support the proposal for social justice, as he has been an advocate and champion of for decades, as it would better reflect in his opinion what Trustee Simon noted in earlier discussions that the proposal is more of a social justice focus with ethnic studies as a component of that broader framework. Superintendent Thurmond commented that the amendment presented a reasonable compromise by referring to the requirement as social justice it would broaden the scope of what many consider ethnic studies but also allow opportunities for even broader conversations around social justice. He thanked Trustee Morales for his amendment and urged trustees to support the motion. Trustee Simon also expressed her support for the amendment and stated that by not changing the language and including ethnic studies in the requirement – when there is not broad support from the ethnic studies community within the CSU – would be disingenuous as the proposal, as she interpreted, does not have ethnic studies as a defined core group of study as the proposed language would suggest and therefore would support the motion to amend the language.

BoT

Agenda Item 1

September 20-23, 2020

Dr. Loren Blanchard, executive vice chancellor for academic and student affairs, provided further clarification that ethnic studies has been at the core of the proposed requirement. He further added that in all consultation with CSU stakeholders they were presented with an opportunity to provide input on a proposal for an ethnic studies and social justice general education requirement and removing ethnic studies at this juncture would be disingenuous to the years of conversations focused on both critical aspects of the proposed requirement. He further noted that if the CSU proposal passes – and AB 1460 also passes – that it would then require six hours of the 48 hours of general education coursework in effect having to reduce three coursework hours from another area in order to accommodate both an ethnic studies and social justice requirement. Based on conversation and consultation with the CSU community regarding this requirement over the years, he noted that this was not the intent but instead the focus was to underscore the importance of ethnic studies as the anchor across the four disciplines tied directly to other oppressed groups and the synergy and the intersection with social justice as well.

Trustee Abrego expressed his support in amending the language to include social justice as reflective of a broader, more inclusive requirement. Trustees Carney, Taylor and Eisen all opposed removing ethnic studies from the Title 5 language. Trustee Eisen mentioned from her experience on the General Education Task Force that to add an additional three units – if the CSU proposal was amended to reflect a social justice requirement and AB 1460 passed to require an ethnic studies course – that could create an undue additional burden for students to timely complete their general education course requirements and ultimately progress towards their degree. Trustee Morales and Superintendent Thurmond both commented that the amendment to change the requirement to a broader social justice framework could potentially align with the proposed AB 1460 requirement without duplicating coursework.

Chancellor White stated that further amending the language to remove ethnic studies could potentially have unintended costs and consequences to the general education requirements. Trustee Carney added that by supporting the motion it would fundamentally change the core substance of the CSU proposal and encouraged trustees to support the proposal without amending the language. Trustee Faigin noted that the proposed amendment to change the language would better reflect a broader definition that is inclusive of ethnic studies under a social justice requirement. Trustee McGrory then called the question to vote on the motion by Trustee Morales.

Following discussion, Chair Kimbell called for the roll call vote. There were six votes to support the motion (Trustees Abrego, Faigin, Khames, Morales, Simon and Superintendent Thurmond), thirteen votes opposed (Trustees Adamson, Carney, Day, Eisen, Farar, Firstenberg, Fong, Kimbell, McGrory, Sabalius, Steinhauser, Taylor and Chancellor White), and no abstentions. The motion to amend the Title 5 language and remove ethnic studies did not pass.

Trustee Taylor made a motion to approve staff's original proposal as approved in committee. There was a second. Chair Kimbell called for the roll call vote. There were thirteen votes to support the motion (Trustees Adamson, Carney, Day, Eisen, Faigin, Farar, Firstenberg, Fong,

Kimbell, McGrory, Steinhauser, Taylor and Chancellor White), five votes opposed (Trustees Abrego, Khames, Morales, Simon and Superintendent Thurmond), and one abstention (Trustee Sabalius). The motion passed. The following resolution was approved by the board:

**Recommended Amendment to Title 5 Regarding Ethnic Studies and Social Justice
(REP 07-20-05)**

RESOLVED, by the Board of Trustees of the California State University, acting under the authority prescribed herein and pursuant to Section 66055.8 and 89030 of the Education Code, that section 40405.1 of Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations is amended as follows:

§ 40405.1. California State University General Education - Breadth Requirements.

(a) Each recipient of the bachelor's degree completing the California State University General Education-Breadth Requirements pursuant to this subdivision (a) shall have completed a program which includes a minimum of 48 semester units or 72 quarter units of which 9 semester units or 12 quarter units shall be upper division level and shall be taken no sooner than the term in which the candidate achieves upper division status. At least 9 of the 48 semester units or 12 of the 72 quarter units shall be earned at the campus granting the degree. The 48 semester units or 72 quarter units shall be distributed as follows:

(1) A minimum of 9 semester units or 12 quarter units in communication in the English language, to include both oral communication and written communication, and in critical thinking, to include consideration of common fallacies in reasoning.

(2) A minimum of 12 semester units or 18 quarter units to include inquiry into the physical universe and its life forms, with some immediate participation in laboratory activity, and into mathematical concepts and quantitative reasoning and their applications.

(3) A minimum of 12 semester units or 18 quarter units among the arts, literature, philosophy and foreign languages.

(4) A minimum of ~~12~~ 9 semester units or ~~18~~ 12 quarter units dealing with human social, political, and economic institutions and behavior and their historical background.

(5) A minimum of 3 semester units or 4 quarter units in study designed to equip human beings for lifelong understanding and development of themselves as integrated physiological, social, and psychological entities.

(6) A minimum of 3 semester units or 4 quarter units at the lower-division in study designed to understand ethnic studies and social justice.

The specification of numbers of units implies the right of discretion on each campus to adjust reasonably the proportions among the categories in order that the conjunction of campus courses,

BoT
Agenda Item 1
September 20-23, 2020

credit unit configurations and these requirements will not unduly exceed any of the prescribed semester or quarter unit minima. However, the total number of units in General Education-Breadth accepted for the bachelor's degree under the provisions of this subdivision (a) shall not be less than 48 semester units or 72 quarter units unless the Chancellor grants an exception.

(b) The president or an officially authorized representative of a college which is accredited in a manner stated in Section 40601 (d) (1) may certify the extent to which the requirements of subdivision (a) of this section have been met up to a maximum of 39 semester units (or 58 quarter units). Such certification shall be in terms of explicit objectives and procedures issued by the Chancellor.

(c) In the case of a baccalaureate degree being pursued by a post-baccalaureate student, the requirements of this section shall be satisfied if:

(1) The student has previously earned a baccalaureate or higher degree from an institution accredited by a regional accrediting association; or

(2) The student has completed equivalent academic preparation, as determined by the appropriate campus authority.

Note: Authority cited: Section 89030, Education Code. Reference: Sections 66055.8 and 89030, Education Code.