ASCSU Plenary Minutes
March 19-20, 2020
Virtual

Thursday, March 19, 2020 – 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m.
Friday, March 20, 2020 - 8:00 a.m. to 3:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL
(CSU Bakersfield) Millar, Tarjan; (CSU Channel Islands) Grzegorczyk, Yudelson; (CSU Chico) Boyd, Ford; (CSU Dominguez Hills) Celly, Norman; (CSU East Bay) Glass, Wu; (CSU Fresno) Jenkins, Schlievert; (CSU Fullerton) Matz, Stambough, Stohs; (Humboldt State) Creadon, Zerbe; (CSU Long Beach) Janousek, Link, Soni; (CSU Los Angeles) Bezdecny, Riggio; (CSU Maritime Academy) Browne, Trevisan; (CSU Monterey Bay) Lopez-Littleton, Waltz; (CSU Northridge) Schutte, Sussman; (CSPU Pomona) Speak, Urey; (CSU Sacramento) Hamilton, Holl; (CSU San Bernardino) Steffel, Ullman; (San Diego State) Butler-Byrd, Csomay, Ornatowski; (San Francisco State) Collins, Sinha, Yee-Melichar; (San José State) Curry, Rodan, Van Selst; (CPSU San Luis Obispo) Laver, Rein; (CSU San Marcos) Barsky, Brodowsky; (Sonoma State) Nelson, Reeder; (CSU Stanislaus) Filling, Strahm; (ERFSA) Pasternack

CALL TO ORDER 8:00 AM, MARCH 19, 2020

With a quorum being present, the meeting was called to order.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Approved as Amended

APPROVAL OF JANUARY 23-24, 2020 MINUTES

Approved

PRESENTATIONS/INTRODUCTIONS

- Jeffrey Reeder for Sonoma State University
- Glen Brodowsky for CSU San Marcos

ANNOUNCEMENTS

None
REPORTS

Chair

- **Campus Senate Chairs**
  - Campus Senate Chairs had two virtual meetings the week of March 16th, 2020 to discuss what was happening throughout the system as the COVID-19 emergency progressed. I joined the Monday meeting. Topics included:
    - Student evaluations of teaching: Several campuses are moving toward allowing faculty to choose whether or not to use spring 2020 student evaluations of teaching in Retention, Tenure, Promotion/Lecturer Review materials.
    - Campus Consultation: Consultation with campus senate leadership amid the Coronavirus Disease of 2019 (COVID-19) emergency varies widely. Campus senate chairs are pressing for proper consultation with local leadership.
    - Student Basic Needs: There is concern among campus senate chairs about how students’ basic needs will be protected and how student access to technology and the internet for remote instruction will be guaranteed.
    - Librarians: Librarians have concerns about their exposure to the corona virus as libraries remain open to serve student/faculty needs.
    - Quality of Instruction: There is general concern about ensuring the quality of instruction amid the move to all-remote coursework.

- **Intersegmental Committee of Academic Senates (ICAS)**
  - ICAS held its Legislative Day Tuesday, March 10, 2020 in Sacramento. We met with consultants from the Assembly Committee on Higher Education and the Assembly Budget Committee, and representatives from the Department of Finance and Legislative Analyst’s Office. Major topics included:
    - Transfer: There is an interest in Sacramento in smooth and efficient transfer for students from the California Community Colleges (CCC) to the CSU/University of California (UC). There is likely to be a hearing in the fall on the 10th anniversary of SB 1440: The Student Transfer Achievement Reform (STAR) Act.
      https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/billNavClient.xhtml?bill_id=200920100SB1440
    - Student Basic Needs: The legislature continues to be interested in finding ways to meet students’ basic needs, with a focus on financial aid and the total cost of attendance.
    - CSU Budget: There was discussion of all three public higher education segments’ budgets. ASCSU representatives made the case for an increase in the $199 Million allocated to the CSU in the Governor’s 2020-2021 budget.
Faculty Diversity: The legislature continues to be interested in faculty diversity in public higher education in California. There will be a hearing on this next fall in the Assembly Higher Education Committee.

AB 3310 (Muratsuchi) CCC Ethnic Studies Requirement: This bill calls for an ethnic studies requirement for the CCCs. The language closely follows the language in AB 1460. This bill would, commencing with the 2021-2022 academic year, require each community college district to offer courses in ethnic studies at each of its campuses. The bill would require that the units earned by students for successful completion of these courses would be eligible for transfer and, if applicable, would meet ethnic studies graduation requirements at the California State University. The bill would also, commencing with the 2023-2024 academic year, require each community college district to require the completion of at least one course in ethnic studies of at least 3 units as a requirement for a student to obtain an associate degree.

https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/billNavClient.xhtml?bill_id=201920200AB3310

The Assembly Higher Ed Staff are concerned that AB 1460/3310 will open the floodgates for legislatively imposed graduation requirements. The staff respects/values the role of academic senates in setting standards for degrees and their control over the content of the curriculum. Senates and ICAS weighing in on this legislation make a difference.

SB 874 (Hill): This legislation will make permanent and expand the CCC Bachelor of Arts (BA) degree pilot program. Assembly Higher Education staff think it will likely pass.

https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/billNavClient.xhtml?bill_id=201920200SB874

March Board of Trustees (BOT) Meeting
- The March BOT meeting will be via teleconference and one day only. The agenda is available at: https://www2.calstate.edu/csu-system/board-of-trustees/Pages/agenda.aspx

Standing committees
- Academic Affairs (AA) – Susan Schlievert, Chair
  - Academic Affairs touched on a variety of topics: maintaining course quality, student access to counseling and advising during this time, community college B.A. degrees, the Graduate Writing requirement (GWAR), campus autonomy, prison education and Project Rebound, campus review processes, improving transfer, campus input and response, reports from Associate Vice Chancellor Alison Wrynn, Assistant Vice Chancellor James Minor, and Executive Committee Liaison Darlene Yee-Melichar…but…
With the proposed implementation memo from Executive Vice Chancellor Lauren Blanchard, Academic Affairs once again spent the majority of the meeting discussing Ethnic Studies.

We started with a sample starting point draft (Yes or No). We reverted to AS-3403-19/AA (Rev). We changed direction several times. We wrote a resolution.

Then late last night, we received some new urgent information. We met before the Plenary this morning. We are meeting during lunch. No vote has been taken.

Because of the time involved, we postponed our Prison Education resolution until the next plenary. And…we had guests: Senator Irene Matz attended the whole session. I trust we didn’t scare her off! And Senator Mark Stohs attended on mute while participating in another committee meeting. Academic Affairs is a solid group.

Finally, the preparation from the Chancellor’s Office, the correspondence, the camaraderie is truly appreciated during this strange, eerie time. And Madame Chair, you didn’t sign on for this, but you and your executive colleagues have been commendable. Thank you.

- **Academic Preparation & Education Programs (APEP) – Susan L. Holl, Chair**
  - Many thanks to the dedicated members of APEP for their service yesterday as we worked diligently until after 5 pm. We are also very grateful to our Chancellor’s Office liaisons – Assistant Vice Chancellors Edward Sullivan and Marquita Grenot-Scheyer. They have been extremely helpful providing input as we determine how to proceed on the many resolutions we have been working on.
  - We started our morning early by meeting with the representatives from WestEd about their study of the Executive Order (EO) 1110 implementation. They have completed a report that indicates there are some positive results from the first year of study.
  - Marquita Grenot-Sheyer discussed an update on the Quantitative Reasoning initiative. They are expanding the Mathematical Reasoning With Connections (MRWC) offerings increasing capacity to provide authentic access to all High School (HS) students. As we move forward students will be advised which courses are most useful for Science, Technology, Engineering & Mathematics (STEM) pathways and which for general success in college.
  - Because of the social distancing restrictions imposed by the COVID-19 crisis, the Commission on Teacher Credentialing (CTC) is making adjustments to allow students who are nearly done with their credential to be authorized to finish in the summer or even after they have taken a permanent job. Additionally, the California Basic Education Skills Test (CBEST) and California Subject Matter Examination for Teachers (CSET) testing is being restricted so College of
Education Deans are working with the CO to determine how to address this problem for teacher prep program applicants.

- We decided to postpone the following resolutions:
  - AS-3407-20/APEP/FGA: Affirming the Role of the CSU Board of Trustees in Adopting Rules, Regulations and Policies Governing the University
  - AS-3409-20/APEP/FGA: Opposition to AB 1930 – CSU/UC Admission Policy
  - AS-3411-20/APEP: Advising High School Juniors Intending to Enroll in the CSU to Enroll In A Mathematics-Reinforcing Course In Their Senior Year
  - AS-3415-20/APEP: Endorsement of Criteria for Chemistry and Physics Model Curricula (MC) for Transfer to Receive the same Admission Advantage as for Transfer Model Curricula

We do plan to bring these back in May.

- We spent the remainder of the meeting perfecting two resolutions:
  - AS-3413-20/APEP (Rev): Exploring common pathways for transfer to the CSU and UC
  - AS-3414-20/APEP (Rev): Resources to Support CSU Faculty Participation in the Course-Identification Numbering System (C-ID) Process

We are very grateful for the insight and advice provided by our liaison Ed Sullivan.

- **Faculty Affairs (FA) - Steven Filling, Chair**
  - Faculty Affairs, as we suspect everyone, had an entertaining, if long, virtual meeting yesterday.
  - We assume that our first virtual plenary will be a “learning experience” for all of us. In light of that, we have chosen to postpone several pending action items authored by this group.
    - AS-3405-19/FA: Creating a Holistic and Humane Educational Environment in the California State University,
    - AS-3410-20/FA: Addition of Dedicated Contingent Faculty Senate Members, and
    - AS-3412-20/FA: Resolution in Support of ORCID (Open Researcher and Contributor ID) for the California State University

have been postponed to the May plenary at our request. Postponing these items is not a signal that the issues addressed are unimportant. In our considered opinion those issues are less time sensitive and we believe that having a less crowded agenda for our first virtual plenary will enable us to more successfully navigate the inevitable challenges that will come up.
Our resolution in support of the American Association of University Professors (AAUP)’s statement on knowledge and higher education returns for action at this plenary. We believe that AAUP’s statement provides a thoughtful contribution to the public conversation about higher education and deserves our support.

Our resolution AS-3416-20/FA/AA/APEP, Request for Review and Update of Intersegmental Curricular Processes has been withdrawn at our request. We believe that the resolutions authored by our APEP colleagues satisfactorily address the issue and we support those resolutions, which are action items at this meeting.

The Open Access Policy Work Group we convened earlier this year had its initial meeting yesterday, and they are cautiously optimistic that they can largely conclude their work by the end of this academic year. We are looking forward to receiving a draft policy acceptable to all parties from them. We will also be reaching out to our California Faculty Association (CFA) colleagues to ensure that the draft policy conforms to the Unit Three contract.

At the request of the Executive Committee, we had a prolonged discussion of the impacts of the COVID-19 pandemic on our universities. Topics addressed during that discussion included the impact on faculty workload, the dire need for appropriate instructional technology support as our campuses shift to non-face-to-face modes of instruction, and the impact on evaluation of faculty. Our resolution on CSU Accommodations to Faculty provides recommendations intended to clarify needs and suggest situational responses to some of the challenges we face. Much more on that when our resolution is presented. We believe that this is an area where ASCSU, CFA, indeed all faculty can find common ground and work jointly to improve our working conditions and our students’ learning conditions. Our conversation with CFA Liaison Kevin Wehr validates that belief.

While we confess to a degree of “video conference exhaustion” we had a productive meeting, and as always I am truly blessed to work with such a talented group of deeply committed individuals.

Finally, we extend our thanks to our friends serving on FGA. As Chair Speak will shortly attest, their herculean efforts to process the torrent of proposed legislation are ongoing and we deeply appreciate them. We’re sorry that we are unable to reward those efforts with a truly sumptuous reception this afternoon. Those virtual shrimp and digital beverages just don’t have quite the same impact.

- **Fiscal & Governmental Affairs (FGA) - David Speak, Chair**

  FGA has been busy since our last plenary, both collectively and in the persons of our Chair and Legislative Specialist. We have been monitoring the state of AB 1460, congruent with the direction given in last year’s tracking resolution,
and, in an affiliated effort, consulting with AA on AS-3420-20/AA “Response to the CSU Chancellor’s Office Memo on Recommended Implementation of a California State University (CSU) Ethnic Studies Requirement (March 17, 2020)”.

- We’ve also been engaging in this year’s leg tracking process, starting in the Fall (since we’re in the second year of the legislature, some of business carries over), getting serious with the start of the new legislative season in January, getting *really* serious with the February 23, 2020 deadline for the introduction of new bills, and culminating in our discussion in a long virtual meeting on Wednesday March 18, 2020. With an initial list of 324 bills of potential interest to the ASCSU, we sorted down to sixty-six and then, using a two-person double examination, created a list of eleven bills to recommend to the whole senate, five of which were given high priority— a modest number reflective of the reduced circumstances of a virtual plenary and designed to focus our efforts. (See AS-3419-20/FGA “2020 Legislative Advocacy Positions of the Academic Senate of the California State University”). We requested a First Reading/Waiver, as is customary in this instance, given the mismatch between the legislative calendar and an academic calendar.

- Given the new world of COVID-19, FGA’s responsibility for advocacy will be more complicated. We’ve committed to meeting virtually before our next formal gathering in April 2020 to strategize.

- With the assistance of non-FGA Senator Rein we crafted a ‘stay-in-your-lane’ resolution (AS-3421-20 “Re-Affirming the Role of the Academic Senate of the California State University and Campus Senates in Establishing Curriculum and Graduation Requirements”) for first reading.

- Thanks to Senator Heidi Riggio and with support from our CO Liaisons Executive Budget Director Kara Perkins and Assistant Vice Chancellor Sheila Thomas, we produced a commendatory resolution to mark the retirement of Chief Audit Officer and Assistant Vice Chancellor Larry Mandel after a career of over fifty years with the CSU. Mandel is himself a CSU alumnus. (AS-3423-20/FGA” Academic Senate CSU (ASCSU) Recognition of Larry Mandel, Vice Chancellor and Chief Audit Officer for the CSU [1997-2020]).

- Thanks to Senator Heidi Riggio we created a draft resolution expressing concern about the Office of Civil Rights’ recently proposed changes to Title IX. We will bring this to a subsequent plenary.

- **Romey Sabalius – CSU Faculty Trustee**
  
  Faculty Trustee, Romey Sabalius, sent his report of the Board’s January meeting to all statewide academic senators on Valentine's Day. The report is now posted on the ASCSU website: [https://www2.calstate.edu/csu-system/faculty-staff/academic-senate/facultytrusteereports/Faculty_Trustee_Report_January_2020.pdf](https://www2.calstate.edu/csu-system/faculty-staff/academic-senate/facultytrusteereports/Faculty_Trustee_Report_January_2020.pdf).
He reported on his many activities in the month of February: campus visits to San Francisco State University (SFSU), CSU Dominguez Hills (CSUDH), and CSU Maritime Academy; attendance at the California chapter of the American Association of University Professors (CA-AAUP) Conference on Shared Governance at the UC Santa Barbara; a recruitment presentation at a church in Oxnard on Super Sunday; participation in local (San Jose State University) Academic Senate and CFA E-Board meetings to stay in touch with current faculty issues.

He also was part of two Los Angeles International Airport (LAX) meetings to identify the next Chancellor of the CSU, a process that now has been placed on hold after the announcement that senior leadership will stay in place until the end of the fall semester (Chancellor White as well as Presidents Morishita [CSU East Bay] and President Harrison [CSU Northridge]).

The COVID-19 crisis brought all planned activities to a screeching halt, such as the final round of the Chancellor search, advocacy trips to Sacramento and Washington, DC, and the National Trustees Conference organized by the Association of Governing Boards (AGB).

Trustee Sabalius announced that the Board meeting next week has been shortened from two days to one and that it will be held virtually. It will be live-streamed and public comment still will be possible (both in the form of submitted statements and verbal comments in real time). However, there will be an abbreviated agenda. Most items will be in consent, and there are only four action items up for discussion: a new multi-use stadium in Mission Valley (San Diego State University), a new off-campus center in Placer County (CSU Sacramento), the final step (Title V change) in the establishment of a Doctorate in Occupational Therapy (San Jose State University and CSUDH), and Compensation for Executives (pulled from the agenda in the meantime).

Trustee Sabalius concluded his remarks by appealing to all CSU stakeholders (executives, administrators, faculty, staff, unions, and students) to pull through this crisis in the spirit of collaboration and trust. For an unexpected and catastrophic event of such a magnitude, there were no contingency plans. Members of every entity of the CSU have to improvise to the best of their abilities and judgements. This is not like an economic downturn, a financial problem, or an enrollment crisis (impaction or drop), but rather this moment is literally about saving lives. All of us are adversely affected by the situation and called upon to manage this crisis together.

Other committees and committee liaisons
- General Education Advisory Committee (GEAC) - Mark Van Selst, Chair
  - Resubmission window (post CCC submission for GE evaluation) - there is now a pilot effort for a 10 day post-evaluation window to allow for technical issues to be addressed as a resubmission/appeal.
Proactive actions re: ethnic studies (now will need to include CSU CO reaction); the GEAC discussion focused on the need for proactive efforts (and was *prior* to the distribution of the CSU CO response to AS-3403 by Dr. Blanchard)

- Flexibility in campus GE (consistency in interpretation of EO 1100); we need to address issues of consistency of interpretation and appropriate campus control over GE instantiation.
- CCC efforts at aligning UC/CSU major preparation vis-a-vis GE (Intersegmental General Education Transfer Curriculum [IGETC] vs IGETC for GE; unit limits; basic inclusion of GE, etc).
- Actions to pursue to ensure better communication with the campuses on GE elements; a suggestion that the Assistant Vice Provosts/Dean of undergraduate studies (or equivalent) be polled to establish contacts for GE on: Assessment, curriculum, catalog content, Faculty GE coordinator/faculty GE chair

- **Faculty Innovation and Leadership Awards (FILA) Selection Committee – Darlene Yee-Melichar, Chair**
  - Senators are asked to share FILA nominations information (see Dropbox: 19-20 ASCSU Shared Files, March 2020) with all faculty colleagues (including tenured, tenure-track, and lecturers).
  - There is a $5,000 cash award and $10,000 to the department for awardee professional development.
  - The deadline for FILA nominations is Friday, May 1, 2020.

- **Ad Hoc Committee on Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (ADEI), Vanessa Lopez-Littleton, Chair**
  - The Ad Hoc Committee met. Senator Vanessa Lopez-Littleton was voted in as Chair and Senator Nola Butler-Byrd as Co-Chair.
  - We serve along with Senators Darlene Yee-Malichar, Mark Stohs, Scott Waltz, Boris Ricks
  - The committee met in March and are still working to set up subsequent meetings.
  - Reminder to be vigilant in looking out for discrimination, harassment and bias.

**SPEAKERS**

**Timothy P. White** – Chancellor, California State University
- Exemplary response and resilience from faculty re: COVID-19 response
- Health and academic continuity as two guiding principles
- Will be this for a long time (new normal)
- BOT Meeting
  - Postponed interviewing new chancellor candidates at BOT meeting
  - Two minutes for ASCSU Report at BOT meeting
Still public comment either in writing or phone for no more than 60 seconds
Governor allowed some relaxation of public meeting rules
CO working 24/7 for public health, sanitizing, etc.
Health piece and budgetary future for us that is not good
Will be increasing costs to manage through this
Will be losing revenues because students are moving out of residence halls, still charging mandatory fees
All previous budget projections off table
Maybe lose 20-25% of students
Will likely lose all of budget augmentation, may lose existing budget
Not being alarmist, trying to be realist
Gravity of situation for state, nation, world
Increasing public and public health pressure to free up space for drive-thru testing or for people sick enough to not be at home but not sick enough to be in the hospital

Jessie Ryan – Campaign for College Opportunity
- Expressed her gratitude for “being made in the CSU” along with millions of other alumni. The Campaign is 16 years old. They began by focusing on the “tidal wave” of California students entering into higher education. As it turned out, there are a multitude of related issues that can use focus by an external group even after the “tidal wave” has largely move through higher education. Racial equity, higher education leadership (reflecting a need for coordination across segments since the demise of California Postsecondary Education Commission [CPEC]), protecting and improving student access and affordability, providing oversight & accountability of policy implementation are the Campaign’s continuing priorities. California is a very diverse state, across a variety of dimensions including race, geography, income, etc. We complete research on a number of topics. We build coalitions, do research, and develop policy recommendations. Perhaps the major focus is on transfer due to workforce needs and both a very low transfer rate and lengthy time to transfer from CCCs to universities. Ms. Ryan gave a comprehensive oral and PowerPoint presentation dealing with transfer, focusing on the Associate Degree for Transfer (ADT). Several senators shared perspectives on making transfer pathways more effective for our students.

Loren Blanchard, Executive Vice Chancellor of Academic and Student Affairs
- Game changing moment, situation is changing continuously regarding COVID-19
- Trying to keep students assistants employed through July 1st, 2020
- Many businesses are closing so students are losing their jobs
- High school students and families are expressing inability to confirm whether they will attend
- Getting high school transcripts is problematic when high schools are closed
• Range of voices responding to Ethnic Studies proposal
• Committed to weekly remote meetings with the ASCSU Executive Committee during the pandemic
• Benevolence and compassion considerations

Barry Pasternack, ASCSU Senator & President, CSU Emeritus and Retired Faculty & Staff Association (CSU-ERFSA) Report
• Senator Pasternack referred us to the latest newsletter. All members are eligible to receive a free Guide to Investing for “Those Over Fifty” from Charlese Schwab (normally costs $30). Are working to preserve pension and health benefits. The CSU ERFSA website has many valuable resources for retirees/those planning to retire. http://csuerfa.org/ The CSU ERFSA newsletter can be found at https://csuerfa.org/images/pdfs/Reporter-Sep-2019.pdf

Jacquelyn Acosta, California State Student Association (CSSA) Liaison Report
No Report

Charles Toombs, California Faculty Association (CFA) Liaison Report
No Report

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS
Creating a Holistic and Humane Educational Environment in the California State University (CSU) Postponed

Affirming the Role of the CSU Board of Trustees in Adopting Rules, Regulations and Policies Governing the University Postponed

Academic Senate CSU (ASCSU) Endorsement of the American Association of University Professors (AAUP) Statement “In Defense of Knowledge and Higher Education” Approved Without Dissent

Opposition to AB 1930 (Medina)– CSU/UC Admission Policy Postponed

Addition of Dedicated Contingent Faculty Senate Members Postponed

Advising High School Juniors Intending to Enroll in the California State University (CSU) in a Mathematics-Reinforcing Course in Their Senior Year Postponed
Resolution in Support of ORCID (Open Researcher and Contributor ID) for the California State University (CSU) Postponed

Exploring Common Pathways for Transfer to the California State University (CSU) and University of California (UC) Approved Unanimously

Resources to Support California State University (CSU) Faculty Participation in the Course-Identification Numbering System (C-ID) Process Approved Unanimously

Endorsement of Criteria for Chemistry and Physics Model Curricula (MC) for Transfer to Receive the Same Admission Advantage as for Transfer Model Curricula (TMC) Postponed

Request for Review and Update of Intersegmental Curricular Processes Withdrawal

Accommodations to Faculty Due to the COVID-19 Emergency Approved Without Dissent

2020 Legislative Advocacy Positions of the Academic Senate of the California State University (ASCSU) Approved Without Dissent

Response to the CSU Chancellor’s Office Memo on Recommended Implementation of a California State University (CSU) Ethnic Studies Requirement (March 17, 2020) Approved

Re-Affirming the Role of the Academic Senate of the California State University (ASCSU) and Campus Senates in Establishing Curriculum and Graduation Requirements Approved

In Support of Lecturer Range Elevation Approved

Academic Senate CSU (ASCSU) recognition of Larry Mandel, Vice Chancellor and Chief Audit Officer for the CSU (1997-2020) Approved by Acclamation

**ADJOURNMENT 3:20 PM, MARCH 20, 2020**